Kris Nelson Community-Based Research Program

. . . a program of the Center for Urban and Regional Affairs (CURA)

West Side Community Indicators Project
2012 Baseline

Prepared in partnership with
West Side Community Organization

Prepared by
Dean Porter
Research Assistant
University of Minnesota

2013

KNCBR Report # 1356

This report is available on the CURA website:
http://www.cura.umn.edu/publications/search
The Kris Nelson Community-Based Research Program is coordinated by the Center for Urban and Regional Affairs (CURA) at the University of Minnesota, and is supported by funding from the McKnight Foundation.

This is a publication of the Center for Urban and Regional Affairs (CURA), which connects the resources of the University of Minnesota with the interests and needs of urban communities and the region for the benefit of all. CURA pursues its urban and regional mission by facilitating and supporting connections between state and local governments, neighborhoods, and nonprofit organizations, and relevant resources at the University, including faculty and students from appropriate campuses, colleges, centers or departments. The content of this report is the responsibility of the author and is not necessarily endorsed by the Kris Nelson Community-Based Research Program, CURA or the University of Minnesota.

© 2013 by The Regents of the University of Minnesota.

This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License. To view a copy of this license, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/ or send a letter to Creative Commons, 444 Castro Street, Suite 900, Mountain View, California, 94041, USA. Any reproduction, distribution, or derivative use of this work under this license must be accompanied by the following attribution: “© The Regents of the University of Minnesota. Reproduced with permission of the University of Minnesota’s Center for Urban and Regional Affairs (CURA).” Any derivative use must also be licensed under the same terms. For permissions beyond the scope of this license, contact the CURA editor.

This publication may be available in alternate formats upon request.

Center for Urban and Regional Affairs (CURA)
University of Minnesota 330 HHH Center
301—19th Avenue South
Minneapolis, Minnesota 55455
Phone: (612) 625-1551
E-mail: cura@umn.edu
Web site: http://www.cura.umn.edu

The University of Minnesota is committed to the policy that all persons shall have equal access to its programs, facilities, and employment without regard to race, color, creed, religion, national origin, sex, age, marital status, disability, public assistance status, veteran status, or sexual orientation.
West Side Initiative
Community Indicators

2012 Baseline

This report was completed in 2013 as part of an effort by the West Side Initiative to bring to life the objectives and strategies outlined in the ten-year West Side Community Plan. By monitoring key community indicators, West Siders can better understand community changes with respect to their vision of a thriving, successful and sustainable West Side.

Dean Porter
Graduate Research Assistant
University of Minnesota
# Table of Contents

Executive Summary ................................................................................................................ 5

Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 6

2012 Baseline ........................................................................................................................ 7-28
  Demographics .................................................................................................................. 7
  Economic Opportunity ..................................................................................................... 10
  Economic Vitality ............................................................................................................ 11
  Educational Attainment ................................................................................................. 14
  Zero Waste Efforts .......................................................................................................... 16
  Monitored and Contaminated Sites .............................................................................. 18
  Housing Cost .................................................................................................................. 20
  Affordable Housing Availability ..................................................................................... 22
  Vacancy ............................................................................................................................ 23
  Home Renovation ............................................................................................................ 24
  Gardening Opportunities ................................................................................................. 25
  Parks and Recreation Spending ....................................................................................... 26
  Mode of Transportation to Work .................................................................................... 27
  Walkability ....................................................................................................................... 28

Works Consulted and Cited ............................................................................................... 29

Appendix A: Instructions for Data Collection ................................................................. 36

Appendix B: Long List of Indicators ................................................................................. 43

Appendix C: West Side Initiative Advisory Committee survey ...................................... 50
Executive Summary

The West Side Initiative Community Indicators were developed in 2013 to monitor community changes on the West Side over the next ten years. This effort to create and monitor indicators began following the West Side Community Plan and the formation of the West Side Initiative, which was created to bring to life the objectives and strategies set forth in the plan. For the purpose of this project, indicators are defined as evidence that helps us assess where we stand and where we are going with respect to our values and goals. This report contains baseline data on key community indicators related to strategy areas such as housing, land use and community economic development. Future data collection and analysis with respect to the baseline data in this report can be used to measure the ways that characteristics of the West Side change over the years. Leaders of the West Side Initiative can use this data to assess the impacts of their efforts and to adapt their strategies in response to changes. The report also includes documentation of the process used to select indicators. This project will be of particular interest to other neighborhood and district council groups interested in tracking indicators that are related to community planning goals.
Introduction

The bulk of this report includes baseline data on fourteen different community indicators for the West Side. The indicators were selected through analysis of the West Side Community Plan and through a community survey of community leaders who are part of the West Side Initiative. Each indicator provides a different piece of evidence about the current characteristics of the West Side. The indicators are intended to correspond to each of the 8 strategy areas in the plan, so the data in this report is diverse. For example, the report includes information about recycling and waste management, affordable housing and walkability.

Community indicators are important because they tie the West Side Plan – the community’s official planning document – to individual activities, initiatives and projects by residents, developers and institutional leaders on the West Side. For example, efforts to increase community gardening space in the neighborhood, to distribute recycle bins, or build affordable housing units are all tied to individual objectives and strategies in the plan. By looking at changes for each of the fourteen indicators in this report every one to two years, West Side residents will be able to tell whether certain objectives and strategies have made a difference in terms of larger neighborhood trends.

A few issues should be considered when monitoring these indicators moving forward. First, community characteristics such as the number of jobs on the West Side are impacted by broad economic trends that go beyond the scope of neighborhood initiatives. In addition, certain data points are more "up to date" than others. For example, American Community Survey data on demographic and economic characteristics is based on a five year trend, and the survey data in this report is more than one year old. Other data sources of data need to be put in context to be properly understood. For example, data on educational attainment is for West Side schools, but does not necessarily represent the educational attainment of all West Side children, due to busing to and from magnet schools in and outside the neighborhood. Thus changes in these indicators could result for a variety of reasons. Neighborhood initiatives to impact certain characteristics of the West Side play an important role in neighborhood change, but any one initiative may or may not be the cause of changes in a particular measure.

With this context in mind, the West Side Community Indicators report here can play an important role in implementing the West Side Plan. West Siders will better understand community change each time that indicators are compared to the baseline. Over the next ten years, this project can help neighborhood leaders and residents approach their vision for a thriving, successful and sustainable West Side.
West Side residents are racially and ethnically diverse. Non-white residents and Hispanic or Latino residents of any race make up more than 55% of the total population.

Source: 2007-2011 American Community Survey (ACS)
Foreign-born residents make up 20% of the West Side’s population. The majority of foreign-born residents were born in Latin America, with sizeable numbers of residents also from Asia and Africa.

Source: 2007-2011 ACS
Nearly 36% of West Side residents speak a language other than English at home. Spanish is the most common language, other than English, spoken in the homes of West Side residents.

Source: 2007-2011 ACS
These measures help us understand the following: *Do West Siders benefit from economic opportunities in their neighborhood? To what degree do West Siders work where they live?*

This data shows that **most West Siders, 5,310 or 96.5% of employed residents, work outside their neighborhood.** Likewise, jobs on the West Side are predominately filled by workers commuting from outside the neighborhood. This analysis demonstrates that few West Siders benefit from employment in their neighborhood. A relatively high unemployment rate further shows that many West Siders are not well matched with economic opportunities, whether in or outside the district.

**Unemployment rate, West Side residents (2007-2011 ACS):**

10.7%
Density of West Side Jobs, 2011

The highest density of jobs is located directly across the river from Downtown Saint Paul. There is considerable density of workers along and near the Northern sections of Highway 52, Robert St., Wabasha St and Cesar Chavez St.

**West Side:**
- 9,428 total jobs
- 2,031 jobs/sq. mile

**Saint Paul (City):**
- 175,002
- 3,115 jobs/sq. mile

Neighborhood Economic Vitality
Community Economic Development

The West Side Initiative seeks to achieve economic vitality by promoting commercial corridors that offer quality employment opportunities, such as the District Del Sol corridor shown here.

Photo credit: District del Sol Plan, City of Saint Paul PED

Image by Lunning Wende Associates

Keeping track of data on neighborhood economic vitality helps answer the following questions about the West Side:

**How many jobs are located on the West Side? How much do employed workers earn? Is the neighborhood adding jobs or losing jobs? What are the characteristics of workers employed on the West Side?**
Neighborhood Economic Vitality
Community Economic Development

The data below show us the following:

- **The West Side lost more than 1,000 jobs between 2009 and 2010, likely due to the economic recession, and the neighborhood rebounded somewhat by adding nearly 350 jobs between 2010 and 2011**

- **Workers on the West Side are predominately white, and more than half have some level of college education**

- **More than half of jobs pay $3,333 or more per month, or $40,000 per year**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total # of jobs on the West Side</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2009: 10,202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010: 9,082</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011: 9,428</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race of workers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>% White alone: 84%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Hispanic/Latino: 7.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Black, Asian, or other race (not Hispanic): 8.1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Worker educational attainment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>% with high school equivalent or less: 25.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% with some college or more: 54.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% unknown education level: 19.8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Worker earnings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>% earning $1,250 per month or less: 11.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% earning $1,251 - $3,333: 33.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% earning $3,333 or more: 55%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: U.S. Census Bureau, OnTheMap Application and LEHD Origin-Destination Employment Statistics (Beginning of Quarter Employment, 2011).*
The West Side Initiative promotes community vitality by increasing involvement in West Side schools, ensuring academic quality, supporting after school programming, and providing opportunities for youth and family engagement. The academic indicators on the following pages are just one piece of information that may be used to track progress towards these goals. Youth engagement goals in the plan, such as youth engagement and career development, may be related to educational attainment but also have other impacts that are not fully addressed by this indicator.

Source: Minnesota Dept. of Education Data Center; Data for Parents and Educators

Note: education data in this report comes from performance indicators for Saint Paul Public Schools located on the West Side. These schools include Humboldt Secondary School, Cherokee Heights Magnet Elementary, Guadalupe Alternative Programs, and Riverview Magnet Elementary School. Some students who attend these schools live on the West Side and others live in other parts of the city. Likewise, some school age children who live on the West Side attend schools in other parts of the city.
Most students attending school on the West Side did not perform well enough on standardized math and reading tests to meet state standards set by educators. In addition, these students were less likely than Saint Paul Public Schools students to meet standards. Encouragingly, the same data set shows that 70% of West Side students had medium or high growth in reading achievement and 66% had medium or high growth math achievement.

Source: Minnesota Dept. of Education Data Center; Data for Parents and Educators
Note: this report shows the percent of tested students who meet or exceed achievement standards set by Minnesota educators.
Zero Waste Efforts
Environment, Water and Natural Resources

“Recycling and composting, as well as engaging in reuse programs like the Twin Cities Free Market, are all important ways that residents on the West Side can take action to have a positive impact on the environment in which they live.” – Christopher Goodwin, Customer Relations and Education Manager, Eureka Recycling

2012 West Side Zero Waste Statistics

Number of bins distributed by WSCO staff: 420*

Free Market usage: 709 residents participated, 24 items exchanged, 1,857 pounds of material re-used**

Total Recycling: 784 tons***

Source: all data from Eureka Recycling
*Eureka's Green Corps member distributed an additional 141 bins. This should be included in future year totals.
**the Free Market is a resident materials exchange program that provides an opportunity to exchange durable goods like appliances and furniture. It prevents unnecessary waste of these materials by finding them a new home.
***note that tonnage can be somewhat misleading as an indicator of recycling program participation. For example, companies are making efforts to reduce packaging weight and poor economic conditions can lead to less consumption and less recycling. Thus, a reduction in tonnage does not necessarily mean that fewer people are participating in recycling programs or that people are recycling less. However, tonnage is still a key indicator to calculate the positive environmental impacts of recycling on the West Side.
Impact of recycling efforts

According to the United States Environmental Protection Agency WARM calculator, West Side efforts to recycling 784 tons of material in 2012 are equivalent to the following:

**Carbon Equivalent Reduction:** 476 metric tons

**Carbon Dioxide Equivalent Reduction:** 1744 metric tons

This is equivalent to removing 342 cars from the road for a year, or 6.5% of West Side households giving up a car for a year. The energy savings could also power 83 homes for one year.

**Jeffrey Morris Calculator**

The Morris model shows that recycling materials with zero waste in mind recognizes not just the value of the resource itself, but the contribution to the health of the community when materials are kept out of landfills and incinerators, avoiding the toxic and carcinogenic emissions.

By saving 784 tons of material, West Siders contributed to the following human health impacts:

**Non-carcinogen toxins reduction:** 868.3 tons

**Acidification (SO2) reduction:** 4.8 tons

**Particulates reduction:** 0.7 tons

**Carcinogens reduction:** 0.4 tons
Monitored and Contaminated Sites
Environment, Natural and Water Resources, Land Use

Number of active MPCA sites: 190

Active sites on the West Side include a variety of activities that the MPCA monitors. Many monitored activities do not pose safety risks for residents, but residents involved with particular activities or projects may be interested in this information. For example, the production of certain types of hazardous waste on a site, for example, may impact the viability of future land uses on the site.
Total # of significant inactive sites: 14

Although these sites are considered remediated and are no longer actively monitored by the MPCA, West Side residents may be interested in major contamination of these sites in past years. Some sites that are no longer monitored may need additional remediation to become suitable for certain land uses.
The median household income on the West Side is $46,025 annually or $3,835 monthly. However, the map demonstrates pockets of higher and lower income households on the West Side. For example, residents along the Mississippi bluffs in the West-Central part of the neighborhood have a median income (by block group) of $80,000+ whereas residents in other areas have a median income of less than $25,000.

Source: 2007-2011 ACS; map created by Dean Porter
Cost burdened households spent more than 30% of income on housing alone. This means that households making the annual median income of $46,000 on the West Side ($3,835 per month) and spending more than $1,150 per month on housing are considered cost burdened.

According to the 2007-2011 American Community Survey, approximately 2,200 households, or 41% of all households on the West Side, are considered cost burdened. About 35% of homeowners are cost burdened whereas nearly 50% of renters spend 30%+ of household income on housing. The map shows that more than 50% of households in the NE part of the West Side are cost burdened. As the map on the previous page demonstrates, the median household income in this area is less than $25,000. This challenge can be addressed through providing more affordable rental and homeownership opportunities in this and other cost burdened parts of the neighborhood.
Affordable Housing Availability
Housing

The 178-unit West Side Flats development will include 36 new units of affordable housing. The project is scheduled for a 2014 completion.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Affordability levels of units</th>
<th>30% AMI</th>
<th>50% AMI</th>
<th>60% AMI</th>
<th>80% AMI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>number of units</td>
<td>367</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>517</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of all affordable units</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

# of subsidized affordable housing units: 1,027
# of properties with subsidized units: 25
Total housing units on the West Side: 5,400
% of total units subsidized: 19%

Data sources: 2007-2011 ACS and MN Housing Link "streams" database
Vacancy
Housing, Land use

The map shows 87 vacant residential parcels (of a total 3,836 parcels on the West Side) making up 11.9 acres, for an average size of about 0.14 acres per parcel. In addition, ACS 2007-2011 data reported 602 vacant housing units or about 10% of units on the West Side.

Vacant residential land is of particular interest to the West Side Plan for two reasons. First, these parcels may provide potential opportunities for new construction in order to meet housing needs for residents of various income levels. These parcels are also relevant to the plans land use and community economic development goals associated with community gardening and urban agriculture. Although parcels may be vacant for a variety of reasons and not all are accessible or suitable for growing food, this can be a temporary or long term use for vacant land on the West Side.

Source: Ramsey County Assessor’s office, parcel dataset; data procured by the Center for Urban and Regional Affairs (CURA)
Home renovation
Housing, Land use, Historic preservation

2012 Locations of additions and remodels to single family homes exceeding 10% of building value

West Side - total number of projects exceeding 10% of building value

Additions: 4
Remodels: 15

Source: St. Paul Dept of Safety and Inspections and Ramsey County Assessor's office; map prepared by Dean Porter

Land use and historic preservation goals in the West Side Plan seek to promote development that maintains the West Side’s traditional urban form on the West Side and when possible emphasizes the preservation of existing structures over demolition and new construction. Since single-family homes make up a large part of the West Side’s traditional development, monitoring investment in existing homes is useful in tracking progress towards these goals.
Gardening opportunities
Community economic development, Land use

Map of public gardens, community gardens, farmers market, and school gardens

West Side Gardening Facts

5 community gardens provide 13,800 sq. ft. of space to grow food
5 public gardens, 9,090 sq. ft., beautify the neighborhood
That’s .53 total acres of public and community garden space total!

Photo: West Side Farmers Market

Sources: Growingwestside.com; acreage calculated using findlotsize.com
In 2012, the City of St. Paul spent over $3 million on West Side parks, about $192 for each West Side resident. Although the city spent about the same amount operating regional and local parks, most of the $2.6 million spent on capital projects (major improvements or repairs) went to regional parks.

Improvements to regional parks have taken priority over local parks for the past three years. The city spent a total of $5.7 million on capital projects for regional parks and only $295,000 on improving local (neighborhood) parks and recreation centers.

Source: St. Paul Parks and Recreation Department
According to the latest data, 69% of 6,647 West Side commuters over age 16 drove to work alone. Other workers carpooled (16%), took public transportation (7.6%), worked at home (3.6%), walked (2.7%) or biked (.5%). The remaining .5% took a taxi or used other means.

The Robert St. Transitway Alternatives study, underway in 2012-2013, could impact transit service on the West Side.

50%+ of residents who drove alone have incomes greater than $35,000

Nearly 90% of transit users make less than $35,000
Walkability
Community economic development, Transportation

Walkable places like Downtown have a wide range of amenities (groceries, restaurants, shops) within walking distance from homes and workplaces. The map shows that areas around George St., Robert St. and Cesar Chavez St. are the most walkable areas on the West Side, making the neighborhood more walkable than the St. Paul average. The walk score will improve as more amenities become available throughout the neighborhood.
Works Consulted and Cited


Galster, George, Chris Hayes, and Jennifer Johnson. "Identifying robust, parsimonious 


Profiles - Minneapolis Saint Paul Neighborhoods. Wilder Research and the Central Corridor 

Quick, Kathryn S., and Martha S. Feldman. "Distinguishing participation and inclusion." Journal 

Tigan, Jane E. Central Corridor Key Outcomes: 2012 Indicators. Wilder Research and the Central 

Sawicki, David S., and Patrice Flynn. "Neighborhood indicators: A review of the literature and 
an assessment of conceptual and methodological issues." Journal of the American Planning 

Sawicki, David S. "Improving community indicator systems: Injecting more social science into 

Web.

*publicly available data sources, such as the 2007-2011 ACS, are cited in the text of the report